

## SECOND PARTY OPINION (SPO)

Sustainability Quality of the Issuer and Sustainable Financing Framework

Commercial Bank of Dubai 10 March 2023

## **VERIFICATION PARAMETERS**

Type(s) of instruments contemplated	Sustainable Financing Instruments	
Relevant standards	Green Bond Principles and Social Bond Principles administered by the ICMA (as of June 2021 with Jappendix 1)	•
	Green Loan Principles and Social Loan Prince administered by LMA (as of February 2021)	ciples, as
Scope of verification	CBD Sustainable Financing Framework (as of March CBD Eligibility Criteria (as of March 9, 2023)	9, 2023)
Lifecycle	Pre-issuance verification	
Validity	As long as there is no material change to the Frame	:work

Sustainability Quality of the Issuer and Sustainable Financing Framework



## **CONTENTS**

SCOPE OF WORK	3
CBD BUSINESS OVERVIEW	3
ASSESSMENT SUMMARY	4
SPO ASSESSMENT	5
PART I: ALIGNMENT WITH ICMA GREEN BOND PRINCIPLES AND SOCIAL BOND PRINCIPLES, L GREEN LOAN PRINCIPLES AND SOCIAL LOAN PRINCIPLES	
PART II: SUSTAINABILITY QUALITY OF THE ISSUANCE	7
A. CONTRIBUTION OF THE SUSTAINABLE FINANCING INSTRUMENTS TO THE UN SDGs	7
B. MANAGEMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL & SOCIAL RISKS ASSOCIATED WITH THE FINANCIAL INSTITUTION AND THE ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA	11
PART III: LINKING THE TRANSACTION(S) TO CBD ESG PROFILE	14
A. CONSISTENCY OF SUSTAINABLE FINANCING INSTRUMENTS WITH CBD SUSTAINABILITY STRATEGY	14
B. CBD BUSINESS EXPOSURE TO ESG RISKS	15
ANNEX 1: Methodology	19
ANNEX 2: Quality management processes	20
About this SPO	21

Sustainability Quality of the Issuer and Sustainable Financing Framework



## SCOPE OF WORK

Commercial Bank of Dubai ("the Issuer" or "CBD") commissioned ISS Corporate Solutions (ICS) to assist with its Sustainable Financing Instruments by assessing three core elements to determine the sustainability quality of the instruments:

- 1. CBD Sustainable Financing Framework (as of March 9, 2023) benchmarked against the International Capital Market Association's (ICMA) Green Bond Principles (GBP) and Social Bond Principles (SBP), and Loan Market Association's (LMA) Green Loan Principles (GLP) and Social Loan Principles (SLP).
- 2. The Eligibility Criteria whether the project categories contribute positively to the UN SDGs and how they perform against proprietary issuance-specific key performance indicators (KPIs) (See Annex 1).
- 3. Linking the transaction(s) to CBD overall ESG profile drawing on the issuance-specific Use of Proceeds categories.

## CBD BUSINESS OVERVIEW

Commercial Bank of Dubai engages in the provision of commercial banking services. It is classified in the Commercial Banks & Capital Markets industry, as per ISS ESG's sector classification.

It operates through the following segments: Institutional Banking, Corporate Banking, Personal Banking, Trading and Other. The Institutional Banking segment includes loan and other credit facilities, deposits, trade finance products, and e-commerce solutions to institutional clients. The Corporate Banking segment offers loans, working capital financing, trade finance, and deposits products to corporate clients. The Personal Banking segment consists of current accounts, easy access saving accounts, fixed rate deposit accounts, personal loans, overdraft facilities, vehicle finance, mortgage products, loans, and other credit facilities to small business and retail clients. The Trading and Other segment undertakes balance sheet management deals and manages the group's proprietary investment portfolio. The company was founded on July 3, 1969 and is headquartered in Dubai, United Arab Emirates.



## **ASSESSMENT SUMMARY**

SPO SECTION	SUMMARY	EVALUATION <sup>1</sup>
Part 1: Alignment with GBP,SBP, GLP, SLP	The Issuer has defined a formal concept for its Sustainable Financing Instruments regarding use of proceeds, processes for project evaluation and selection, management of proceeds and reporting. This concept is in line with the ICMA GBP and SBP, LMA GLP and SLP.	Aligned
Part 2: Sustainability quality of the Eligibility Criteria	The Sustainable Financing Instruments will (re-)finance eligible asset categories which include: Renewable Energy, Green Buildings, Pollution Prevention and Control, Clean Transportation and Access to Education.  The use of proceeds categories have a significant contribution to SDGs 7 'Affordable and Clean Energy', 11 'Sustainable Cities and Communities', 12 'Responsible Consumption and Production', and 13 'Climate Action'. They also have a limited contribution to SDGs 3 'Good Health and Well-being' and 4 'Quality Education'.  The environmental and social risks associated with those use of proceeds categories are well managed.	Positive
Part 3: Linking the transaction(s) to CBD overall ESG profile	The key sustainability objectives and the rationale for issuing Sustainable Financing Instruments are clearly described by the Issuer. The majority of the project categories considered are in line with the sustainability objectives of the Issuer.	Consistent with Issuer's sustainability strategy

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The evaluation is based on the CBD's Sustainable Finance Framework as of March 9, 2023, and on the ISS ESG Corporate Rating updated Indicative Corporate Rating applicable at the SPO delivery date.



## SPO ASSESSMENT

# PART I: ALIGNMENT WITH ICMA GREEN BOND PRINCIPLES AND SOCIAL BOND PRINCIPLES, LMA GREEN LOAN PRINCIPLES AND SOCIAL LOAN PRINCIPLES

This section evaluates the alignment of the CBD Sustainable Financing Framework (as of March 9, 2023) with the ICMA Green Bond Principles (GBP) and Social Bond Principles (SBP), and LMA Green Loan Principles (GLP) and Social Loan Principles (SLP).

ICMA GBP AND SBP, LMA GLP AND SLP	ALIGNMENT	OPINION
1. Use of Proceeds	✓	The Use of Proceeds description provided by CBD Sustainable Financing Framework is <b>aligned</b> with the ICMA GBP and SBP, LMA GLP and SLP.  The Issuer's green and social categories align with the project categories as proposed by the ICMA GBP and SBP, LMA GLP and SLP. Criteria are defined in a clear and transparent manner. Disclosure of distribution of proceeds by project category is provided and environmental and social benefits are described.
2. Process for Project Evaluation and Selection	<b>√</b>	The Process for Project Evaluation and Selection description provided by CBD Sustainable Financing Framework is aligned with the ICMA GBP and SBP, LMA GLP and SLP.  The project selection process is defined and ESG risks associated with the project categories are identified and managed through an appropriate process. Moreover, the projects selected show alignment with the sustainability strategy of the Issuer.  The Issuer involves various stakeholders in this process, in line with best marked practice.
3. Management of Proceeds	✓	The Management of Proceeds proposed by CBD Sustainable Financing Framework is <b>aligned</b> with the ICMA GBP and SBP, LMA GLP and SLP.  The net proceeds collected will be equal to the amount allocated to eligible projects, with no exceptions. The net proceeds are tracked in an appropriate manner. The net proceeds are managed on an aggregated basis for multiple Green Bonds (portfolio approach). Moreover, the

Sustainability Quality of the Issuer and Sustainable Financing Framework



		Issuer discloses the temporary investment instruments for unallocated proceeds.
4. Reporting	✓	The allocation and impact reporting proposed by CBD Sustainable Financing Framework is <b>aligned</b> with the ICMA GBP and SBP, LMA GLP and SLP.
		The Issuer commits to disclose the allocation of proceeds transparently and to report in an appropriate frequency. The reporting will be publicly available on the Issuer's website. CBD explains the level of expected reporting and the type of information that will be reported. Moreover, the Issuer commits to report annually, until the proceeds have been fully allocated.
		The Issuer is transparent on the information reported, frequency, duration, scope and level of impact reporting, in line with best market practice. The Issuer commits to get the allocation report audited by an external party, in line with best market practice.

Sustainability Quality of the Issuer and Sustainable Financing Framework



## PART II: SUSTAINABILITY QUALITY OF THE ISSUANCE

## A. CONTRIBUTION OF THE SUSTAINABLE FINANCING INSTRUMENTS TO THE UN SDGs<sup>2</sup>

Companies can contribute to the achievement of the SDGs by providing specific services/products which help address global sustainability challenges, and by being responsible corporate actors, working to minimize negative externalities in their operations along the entire value chain.

The assessment of UoP categories for (re)financing products and services is based on a variety of internal and external sources, such as the ISS ESG SDG Solutions Assessment (SDGA), a proprietary methodology designed to assess the impact of an Issuer's products or services on the UN SDGs, as well as other ESG benchmarks (the EU Taxonomy Climate Delegated Acts, the ICMA Green and/or Social Bond Principles and other regional taxonomies, standards and sustainability criteria).

The assessment of UoP categories for (re)financing specific products and services is displayed on 5-point scale (see Annex 1 for methodology):

Significant	Limited	No	Limited	Significant
Obstruction	Obstruction	Net Impact	Contribution	Contribution

Each of the Sustainable Financing Instruments' Use of Proceeds categories has been assessed for its contribution to, or obstruction of, the SDGs:

USE OF PROCEEDS (PRODUCTS/SERVICES)	CONTRIBUTION OR OBSTRUCTION	SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT GOALS <sup>3</sup>
Green Buildings  New or existing buildings that have achieved (or will achieve⁴):  ■ BREEAM, Building Research Establishment Environmental Assessment Method, 'Excellent' or better  ■ HQE, Hauté Qualite Environmentale, 'Excellent' or better  ■ LEED, Leadership in Energy and Environment Design, 'Gold' or better  ■ Al Sa'fat, Dubai Green Building System in the Emirate of Dubai 'Gold' or better  ■ Estidama, Pearl Building Rating System in the Emirate of Abu Dhabi '2 Pearl Rating' or better	Significant Contribution	7 AFFORDABLE AND 11 SUSTAMABLE CITES 13 CUNATE AND COMMUNITIES 13 ACTION

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The impact of the UoP categories on UN Social Development Goals is assessed with proprietary methodology and may therefore differ from the Issuer's description in the framework.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> The review is limited to the examples of certifications spelled out in the Framework.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Should the asset not reach any of the described certifications, it will be removed from the Green Portfolio.

Sustainability Quality of the Issuer and Sustainable Financing Framework



## **Green Buildings**

Refurbishment of new buildings targeting to achieve environmental certifications in:

- BREEAM, Building Research
   Establishment Environmental
   Assessment Method, 'Excellent' or better
- HQE, Hauté Qualite Environmentale, 'Excellent' or better
- LEED, Leadership in Energy and Environment Design, 'Gold' or better
- Al Sa'fat, Dubai Green Building System in the Emirate of Dubai 'Gold' or better
- Estidama, Pearl Building Rating
   System in the Emirate of Abu Dhabi '2
   Pearl Rating' or better

Limited Contribution



## **Green Buildings**

New and existing buildings that are within the top 15% most energy efficient buildings in their respective region, as determined through, for instance, a specialist green building consultant study - when proxied with Al Sa'fat Green Building System (Gold or better) or Estidama – Pearl Rating System (Two Pearl or better)

Significant Contribution



## **Green Buildings**

New and existing buildings that are within the top 15% most energy efficient buildings in their respective region, as determined through, for instance, a specialist green building consultant study – when based on building year of construction<sup>5</sup>

Limited Contribution



<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Whenever the building certification rating is not available, the year of construction of the building (2017 or newer in Abu Dhabi, and 2019 or newer for buildings in Dubai and 2020 or newer for villas in Dubai) will be used as a proxy, in line with the local applicable law (The "Executive Council Order of May 2010" for Abu Dhabi and "Dubai Green Building System replacement in October 2020"). This methodology has been developed by the green building consultant (Drees & Sommer) to ensure that buildings following those criteria are part of the top 15% most energy efficient buildings in their respective region.

Sustainability Quality of the Issuer and Sustainable Financing Framework



## **Renewable Energy**

Wind: Onshore and offshore

Solar: Photovoltaic solar power, concentrated

solar power (CSP)

Green hydrogen: produced by electrolysis using

100% wind and/or solar power

Significant Contribution





## **Clean Transportation**

Financing low carbon transportation solutions and related infrastructures:

**Bicycles** 

**Significant** Contribution

Limited Contribution



13 CLIMATE



## **Clean Transportation**

Financing low carbon transportation solutions and related infrastructures:

Charging stations and bicycle paths

**Significant** Contribution

Limited Contribution

Limited

Contribution



## **Clean Transportation**

Financing low carbon transportation solutions and related infrastructures:

- Public transport (e.g., trains, subways, trams, electric and hybrid buses as well as zero direct tailpipe CO2 emissions boats);
- Private vehicles (e.g., electric and hydrogen vehicles) with direct emissions below 50 gCO2e/pkm;
- Construction, improvement, maintenance, and extension of related infrastructure (e.g., stations upgrade, railway networks, signaling for rail infrastructure)

## **Pollution Prevention and Control**

Waste collection and transport

**Significant** 

**Significant** Contribution





**Pollution Prevention Control** 

Waste sorting and recycling infrastructure

Contribution

**Social Categories** 

Sustainability Quality of the Issuer and Sustainable Financing Framework



## Access to education

Financial support at preferential rates to access education through student loans





Sustainability Quality of the Issuer and Sustainable Financing Framework



# B. MANAGEMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL & SOCIAL RISKS ASSOCIATED WITH THE FINANCIAL INSTITUTION AND THE ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA

The table below evaluates the Eligibility Criteria against issuance-specific KPIs. The entirety of the assets are and will be located in United Arab Emirates.

#### ASSESSMENT AGAINST KPIS

## **ESG** guidelines into lending process

CBD identifies the potential ESG risks of a proposed transaction or relationship as part of its know-your-customer, due diligence and other onboarding process. The Issuer will apply the European Bank for Reconstruction and Development (EBRD) industry classifications to assess the overall ESG risk profile of the assets. If ESG risks are identified, the credit committee will assess and factor these risks into the decision-making process. In some cases, CBD may decline to participate in a specific transaction, although the issuer claims that no cases happened for environmental damaging business activity.

A ESG Policy<sup>6</sup> is being drafted by the Issuer and will be in place in April 2023, stating principles and guidelines the Bank follows when defining and delivering ESG initiatives annually. The document describes the governance structure and internal controls that will be in place to carry out sustainable activities.

A due diligence is conducted by CBD's front-line unit and this process may include but is not limited to client engagement, media searches as well as escalated to the credit committee which will assess and factor these risks in the decision-making process.

CBD restricts lending to certain types of activities, that includes any gaming/gambling-related activities, motion picture production, development or distribution except exposure to cinemas, arms and armaments except where these relate to contract financing for general headquarter and companies and/or industries that do not comply with the country's environmental laws.

The ESG risk assessment process is applicable to the project and underlying asset level financing under the Framework, as well as onboarding new clients for general purpose financing.

The Issuer will expand its Credit Risk Policy to elaborate on the process for identifying and managing environmental and social risk by April 2023.

## Labour, Health and Safety



CBD has a due diligence process to ensure all its customer are not performing any activities with negative reputational impact on CBD and respect the law of UAE, including labor law and standards on health and safety of employees. Moreover, the Wholesale Credit Policy is guided by the UAE's Labor Law and Occupational Health and Safety Management

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Assessment in this section has several references to the ESG Policy presented by the issuer in draft mode. CBD has committed to have the Policy in place by April 2023

Sustainability Quality of the Issuer and Sustainable Financing Framework



System National Standard in conjunction with IFC performance standard 2 and 4. Any non-compliant activity can be filtered through this process.

## **Biodiversity and Community dialogue**

CBD excludes lending to certain types of activities, including companies and/or industries that do not comply with the country's environmental laws. Moreover, CBD's Wholesale Credit Policy is guided by action plans issued by the UAE's Ministry of Climate Change and Environment and IFC performance standard 6 concerning the protection of biodiversity. It is also guided by IFC performance standard 4 regarding community dialogue.

### Inclusion

CBD confirms that it complies with Law No. (2) of 2021 Concerning the Knowledge and Human Development Authority in Dubai which includes Special Development Zones and free zones. Moreover the Bank confirms that its educational loans are accessible to all without any discrimination on the economic situation. They are offered at a discounted rate and the minimum salary requirement is reduced to capture lower income population.

## Data protection and information security

CBD confirms to protect the data and information by advanced technology and multilayered privacy safeguard<sup>7</sup>, that include a framework of policies and protocols conforming to ISO27001, encryption and verification standards, training and awareness-building, as well as regular risk assessments and compliance counterchecks to keep the integrity of the security measures. Moreover, the Bank will seek ISO Certification of its information security management system as part of its ESG Initiatives in 2023.

## Responsible treatment of customers with debt repayment problems

CBD has set out pre-emptive requirement for the characteristics and coverage of the level of risk analysis in the Wholesale Credit Risk Policy for the prevention of client debt repayment problems from wholesale banking. That include requiring the analysis to be relative to the quantum and type of credit risk proposed and the mitigation/ alternate sources of repayment that may exist. For personal banking, the Bank confirms to comply with Consumer Protection Regulation<sup>8</sup> in particularly Article 7- responsible financing practice. The compliance is audited on a yearly basis by internal and external independent parties.

## Sales practices

CBD has zero tolerance for any mis-selling activity under the HR Code of Conduct. In addition, the Bank has a dedicated Sales Performance Management policy to affect the sales incentives in cases of poor customer service or irresponsible sales practices. There

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> CBD Sustainability Report 2021 <a href="https://www.cbd.ae/docs/librariesprovider2/default-document-library/cbd-sustainability-report-2021.pdf?Status=Temp&sfvrsn=624436b">https://www.cbd.ae/docs/librariesprovider2/default-document-library/cbd-sustainability-report-2021.pdf?Status=Temp&sfvrsn=624436b</a> 2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Consumer Protection Regulation for Central Bank of the U.A.E. <a href="https://www.centralbank.ae/media/vi1klb11/consumer-protection-regulation">https://www.centralbank.ae/media/vi1klb11/consumer-protection-regulation</a> 0.pdf

Sustainability Quality of the Issuer and Sustainable Financing Framework



are on-going customer surveys as part of the Bank's Voice of the Customer Program, and complaints to be handled by independent Complaint Handling team that reports to the Chief Customer Officer. Moreover, the Bank confirms to comply with Consumer Protection Regulation in particularly Article 2- disclosure and transparency.

## Responsible marketing

CBD wholesale banking business unit is responsible to set pricing parameters in consultation with finance team of CBD to ensure the proposed credit facilities are priced appropriately for the risk assumed. Moreover, the Bank confirms to comply with Consumer Protection Regulation Article 2, 4 and 5 for personal banking, regarding disclosure and transparency, market and business conduct.

#### **Exclusion criteria**

CBD has no exclusion criteria. However, the issuer restricts lending to certain types of activities, that includes any gaming/gambling related activities, motion picture production, development or distribution except exposure to cinemas, arms and armaments except where these relate to contract financing for general headquarter and companies and/or industries that do not comply with the country's environmental laws. Moreover, the Bank has Anti-Money Laundering policy in place, as well as due diligence process at the point of customer onboarding and on an ongoing basis to ensure the exclusion criteria has been implemented.

Sustainability Quality of the Issuer and Sustainable Financing Framework



## PART III: LINKING THE TRANSACTION(S) TO CBD ESG PROFILE

# A. CONSISTENCY OF SUSTAINABLE FINANCING INSTRUMENTS WITH CBD SUSTAINABILITY STRATEGY

## Key sustainability objectives and priorities defined by the Issuer

CBD is supporting the UAE Net Zero by 2050 strategic initiative and the drive to transition towards a climate-neutral economy. By financing projects under this Framework in the Clean Transportation or Renewable Energy sector, for example, it aims to reduce the carbon emissions in the UAE and contribute to the transition to sustainable core business activities. Access to Education is one of the 5 core ESG Pillars that the issuer has communicated publicly (financial literacy and education pillar) in line with the UAE's education national priority and to ensure inclusive and quality education to all.

In 2022, CBD together an external consultant completed a materiality assessment to review the most relevant ESG topics of the company. The following steps were taken to identify the key ESG topics for CBD stakeholders:

- 1. Refinement of key ESG topics
- 2. Stakeholder engagement
- 3. Quantitative and qualitative findings analysis

To guide the Company's net zero transition, CBD has an ESG Council co-chaired by the Chief Customer Officer and the Chief Risk Officer, consisting of the Head of Sustainability, along with three members of the senior management team. The Council meets bi-annually and is responsible for the review of the portfolio, approval of Sustainable Reporting and monitor the evolution of the sustainable finance business.

For the projects covered by this Framework, CBD has issued policies aimed at mitigating known material risks, including the ESG Policy. The ESG Council is responsible during the evaluation and selection of projects for addressing perceived environmental and social risks as part of the approval and monitorization of the projects.

CBD is a member of the Dubai Sustainable Finance Working Group, which is chaired by the Dubai International Financial Center.

There is no information available on the Issuer quantified ESG targets. There is no information available on whether the Issuer follows relevant ESG reporting guidelines.

## Rationale for issuance

By publishing the Sustainable Finance Framework and issuing sustainable financing instruments, CBD aims to contribute to the transition of the business landscape in UAE. Financing Green Buildings, Renewable Energy, Clean Transportation and Pollution Prevention and Control projects will support the reduction of the carbon footprint of the country and accelerate the transition to sustainable business. For Access to Education, the issuer has the ambition to promote and encourage access to education by the community and its customers in line with the UAE's education national priority and to ensure inclusive and quality education to all.

Sustainability Quality of the Issuer and Sustainable Financing Framework



**Opinion:** The key sustainability objectives and the rationale for issuing Sustainable Financing Instruments are well described by the Issuer. All project categories financed are in line with the sustainability objectives of the Issuer.

## B. CBD BUSINESS EXPOSURE TO ESG RISKS

This section aims to provide an overall level of information on the ESG risks to which the Issuer is exposed through its business activities, providing additional context to the issuance assessed in the present report.

## ESG risks associated with the Issuer's industry

The Issuer is classified in the Commercial Banks & Capital Markets, as per ISS ESG's sector classification. Key challenges faced by companies in terms of sustainability management in this industry are displayed in the table below. Please note, that this is not a company specific assessment but areas that are of particular relevance for companies within that industry.

ESG KEY ISSUES IN THE INDUSTRY		
Sustainability impacts of lending and other financial services/ products		
Customer and Product responsibility		
Sustainable Investment Criteria		
Labor standards and working conditions		
Business Ethics		

## ESG strengths and points of attention related to the Issuer's disclosures

Leveraging ISS ESG's Research, the following strengths and points of attention<sup>9</sup> have been identified:

STRENGTHS	POINTS OF ATTENTION
The company has implemented some measures to ensure customer and product safety through an information security management system (ISMS). Additionally, the company commits to responsible marketing practices through accurate and transparent pricing of its products and services.	The company has a privacy policy. However, it remains uncertain if the company has a procedure in place to ensure information security in its outsourced data processing. Further, it remains unclear if the company has a formal structure for the responsible treatment of clients with debt repayment problems.
Further, the company has laid out a customer service charter to assess and track customer complaints.	

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Please note that CBD is not part of the ISS ESG Corporate Rating Universe. Thus, the information is based on a disclosure review conducted by the analyst in charge of the Commercial Banks & Capital Markets sector, based on publicly available information exclusively. No direct communication between the Issuer and the analyst has taken place during the process. The below is not based on an ISS ESG Corporate Rating but considers ISS ESG Research's methodology.

Sustainability Quality of the Issuer and Sustainable Financing Framework



The company offers flexible working schedules and remote working options as benefits to its employees and has an employee assistance program to offer counselling services to its employees. Further, the employees are entitled to special leaves such as maternity & paternity leaves, paid leaves for exams, and volunteering.

Additionally, the company has provisions and catalogues to ensure training and awareness regarding health for its employees.

The company has formally charted out an antimoney laundering policy to a varied degree of detail. Additionally, the company ensures compliance through employee training. Further, confidential reporting channels are provided for employees for noncompliance reporting.

The company has implemented some elements of health and safety management system such as emergency response, training & awareness raising, structures & responsibilities, and programs. However, the company has not provided evidence supporting the implementation of a health and safety management system (HSMS) certified to an international standard

The company has not disclosed a code of its business ethics that covers key aspects such as anti-corruption, anti-insider dealing, and conflicts of interest. Additionally, it is unclear if the company conducts compliance risk assessments and audits and has provisions for third-party anti-corruption due diligence

The company has not disclosed information with regard to its general social and environmental guidelines for lending and investment banking that covers social and environmental impact, risk assessment, human rights, labor rights, community health and safety, resource efficiency, pollution, ecosystem, and climate change. The application procedures of environmental and social guidelines and transparency on implementation such as risk and impact assessment, action plans, approval process, and training remain unclear.

Please note that the consistency between the issuance subject to this report and the Issuer's sustainability strategy is further detailed in Part III.B of the report.

## Sustainability impact of products and services portfolio

Leveraging ISS ESG's Sustainability Solutions Assessment methodology, the contribution of the Issuer's current products and services portfolio to the Sustainable Development Goals defined by the United Nations (UN SDGs) has been assessed as per the table below. This analysis is limited to the evaluation of final product characteristics and does not include practices along the Issuer's production process.

## Social impact of the product portfolio:

The company primarily has products in institutional banking, corporate banking, retail banking, and trading and offers treasury services, including bonds, commodities and interest rate hedging, foreign exchange, and investment services; payment and cash management services; capital advisory solutions; insurance products. The company's products and services cater to sectors such as

Sustainability Quality of the Issuer and Sustainable Financing Framework



manufacturing, construction, real estate, transportation, hospitality, and individual loan for businesses. The company's products and services neither has positive nor negative contributions to social sustainability objectives. Thus, the impact of the product portfolio on social sustainable development goals (SDG) is considered neutral.

## **Environmental impact of the product portfolio:**

The company primarily has products in institutional banking, corporate banking, retail banking, and trading and offers treasury services, including bonds, commodities and interest rate hedging, foreign exchange, and investment services; payment and cash management services; capital advisory solutions; insurance products. The company's products and services cater to sectors such as manufacturing, construction, real estate, transportation, hospitality, and individual loan for businesses. The company's products and services neither has positive nor negative contributions to environmental sustainability objectives. Thus, the impact of the product portfolio on environmental sustainable development goals (SDG) is considered neutral.

## Breaches of international norms and ESG controversies

## At Issuer level

At the date of publication and leveraging ISS ESG Research, no controversy in which the Issuer would be involved has been identified.

## At industry level

Based on a review of controversies over a 2-year period, the top three issues that have been reported against companies within the Commercial Banks & Capital Markets industry are as follows: Failure to mitigate climate change impacts, failure to prevent money laundering, and failure to respect the right to just and favorable conditions of work.

Please note, that this is not a company specific assessment but areas that can be of particular relevance for companies within that industry.

Sustainability Quality of the Issuer and Sustainable Financing Framework



## **DISCLAIMER**

- 1. Validity of the Second Party Opinion ("SPO"): As long as there is no material change to the Framework.
- 2. ISS Corporate Solutions, Inc. ("ICS"), a wholly-owned subsidiary of Institutional Shareholder Services Inc. ("ISS"), sells/distributes Second Party Opinions which are prepared and issued by ISS ESG, the responsible investment arm of ISS, on the basis of ISS ESG's proprietary methodology. In doing so, ISS adheres to standardized procedures to ensure consistent quality of responsibility research worldwide. Information on ISS's methodology is available upon request.
- 3. Second Party Opinions are based on data provided by the party to whom the Second Party Opinion is provided ("Recipient"). ISS does not warrant that the information presented in this Second Party Opinion is complete, accurate or up to date. Neither ISS or ICS will have any liability in connection with the use of these Second Party Opinions, or any information provided therein.
- 4. Statements of opinion and value judgments given by ISS are not investment recommendations and do not in any way constitute a recommendation for the purchase or sale of any financial instrument or asset. In particular, the Second Party Opinion is not an assessment of the economic profitability and creditworthiness of a financial instrument, but refers exclusively to the social and environmental criteria mentioned above. Statements of opinion and value judgments given by ISS are based on the information provided by the Recipient during the preparation of the Second Party Opinion and may change in the future, depending on the development of market benchmarks, even if ISS is requested by the Recipient to provide another Second Party Opinion on the same scope of work.
- 5. This Second Party Opinion, certain images, text and graphics contained therein, and the layout and company logo of ICS, ISS ESG, and ISS are the property of ISS and are protected under copyright and trademark law. Any use of such ISS property shall require the express prior written consent of ISS. The use shall be deemed to refer in particular to the copying or duplication of the Second Party Opinion wholly or in part, the distribution of the Second Party Opinion, either free of charge or against payment, or the exploitation of this Second Party Opinion in any other conceivable manner.

The Recipient that commissioned this report may have purchased self-assessment tools and publications from ICS or ICS may have provided advisory or analytical services to the Recipient. No employee of ICS played a role in the preparation of this report. If you are an ISS institutional client, you may inquire about any Recipient's use of products and services from ICS by emailing disclosure@issgovernance.com.

This report has not been submitted to, nor received approval from, the United States Securities and Exchange Commission or any other regulatory body. While ISS exercised due care in compiling this report, it makes no warranty, express or implied, regarding the accuracy, completeness or usefulness of this information and assumes no liability with respect to the consequences of relying on this information for investment or other purposes. In particular, the research and scores provided are not intended to constitute an offer, solicitation or advice to buy or sell securities nor are they intended to solicit votes or proxies.

Deutsche Börse AG ("DB") owns an approximate 80% stake in ISS HoldCo Inc., the holding company which wholly owns ISS. The remainder of ISS HoldCo Inc. is held by a combination of Genstar Capital ("Genstar") and ISS management. ISS has formally adopted policies on non-interference and potential conflicts of interest related to DB, Genstar, and the board of directors of ISS HoldCo Inc. These policies are intended to establish appropriate standards and procedures to protect the integrity and independence of the research, recommendations, ratings and other analytical offerings produced by ISS and to safeguard the reputations of ISS and its owners. Further information regarding these policies is available at <a href="https://www.issgovernance.com/compliance/due-diligence-materials">https://www.issgovernance.com/compliance/due-diligence-materials</a>.
© 2023 | Institutional Shareholder Services and/or its affiliates

Sustainability Quality of the Issuer and Sustainable Financing Framework



## ANNEX 1: Methodology

## **Green and Social KPIs**

The Green and Social KPIs serve as a structure for evaluating the sustainability quality – i.e. the social and environmental added value – of the use of proceeds of CBD Sustainable Financing Instruments.

It comprises firstly the definition of the use of proceeds category offering added social and/or environmental value, and secondly the specific sustainability criteria by means of which this added value and therefore the sustainability performance of the assets can be clearly identified and described.

The sustainability criteria are complemented by specific indicators, which enable quantitative measurement of the sustainability performance of the assets and which can also be used for reporting. If a majority of assets fulfill the requirement of an indicator, this indicator is then assessed positively. Those indicators may be tailor-made to capture the context-specific environmental and social risks.

## Environmental and social risks assessment methodology

The Environmental and social risks assessment evaluates whether the assets included in the asset pool match the eligible project category and criteria listed in the Green and Social KPIs.

All percentages refer to the amount of assets within one category (e.g. wind power). Additionally, the assessment "no or limited information is available" either indicates that no information was made available or that the information provided did not fulfil the requirements of the Green and Social KPIs

The evaluation was carried out using information and documents provided on a confidential basis by CBD (e.g. Due Diligence Reports). Further, national legislation and standards, depending on the asset location, were drawn on to complement the information provided by the Issuer.

## Assessment of the contribution and association to the SDG

The 17 Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) were endorsed in September 2015 by the United Nations and provide a benchmark for key opportunities and challenges toward a more sustainable future. Using a proprietary method, the extent to which CBD Sustainable Financing Instruments contributes to related SDGs has been identified.

Sustainability Quality of the Issuer and Sustainable Financing Framework



## ANNEX 2: Quality management processes

## **SCOPE**

CBD commissioned ICS to compile a Sustainable Financing Instruments SPO. The Second Party Opinion process includes verifying whether the Sustainable Financing Framework aligns with the ICMA GBP and SBP, LMA GLP and SLP to assess the sustainability credentials of its Sustainable Financing Instruments, as well as the Issuer's sustainability strategy.

#### **CRITERIA**

Relevant Standards for this Second Party Opinion

- ICMA Green Bond Principles and Social Bond Principles
- LMA Green Loan Principles and Social Loan Principles
- Key Performance Indicators relevant for Use of Proceeds categories selected by the Issuer

## **ISSUER'S RESPONSIBILITY**

CBD responsibility was to provide information and documentation on:

- Framework
- Eligibility criteria
- Documentation of ESG risks management

## ISS ESG's VERIFICATION PROCESS

ISS ESG is one of the world's leading independent environmental, social and governance (ESG) research, analysis and rating houses. The company has been actively involved in the sustainable capital markets for over 25 years. Since 2014, ISS ESG has built up a reputation as a highly-reputed thought leader in the green and social bond market and has become one of the first CBI approved verifiers.

This independent Second Party Opinion of the Sustainable Financing Instruments to be issued by CBD has been conducted based on a proprietary methodology and in line with the ICMA GBP and SBP, LMA GLP and SLP.

The engagement with CBD took place from January to March 2023.

## **ISS' BUSINESS PRACTICES**

ISS has conducted this verification in strict compliance with the ISS Code of Ethics, which lays out detailed requirements in integrity, transparency, professional competence and due care, professional behavior and objectivity for the ISS business and team members. It is designed to ensure that the verification is conducted independently and without any conflicts of interest with other parts of the ISS Group.

Sustainability Quality of the Issuer and Sustainable Financing Framework



## About this SPO

ISS ESG is one of the world's leading rating agencies in the field of sustainable investment. The agency analyses companies and countries regarding their environmental and social performance.

We assess alignment with external principles (e.g. the ICMA Green / Social Bond Principles), analyse the sustainability quality of the assets and review the sustainability performance of the Issuer themselves. Following these three steps, we draw up an independent SPO so that investors are as well informed as possible about the quality of the bond / loan from a sustainability perspective.

Learn more: https://www.isscorporatesolutions.com/solutions/esg-solutions/green-bond-services/

For more information on SPO services, please contact: SPOsales@isscorporatesolutions.com

For more information on this specific Sustainable Financing Instruments SPO, please contact: SPOOperations@iss-esg.com

## Project team

Project lead Project support Project supervision

Fabio Silva Alice Wong Marie-Bénédicte Beaudoin

Associate Associate Associate Director

ESG Consultant ESG Consultant Head of ISS ESG SPO Operations